

Academic excellence for business and the professions

A Requirements-led Approach for Specifying QoS-aware Service Choreographies: An Experience Report

Neil Maiden, James Lockerbie, Konstantinos Zachos City University London

Antonia Bertolino, Guglielmo De Angelis, Francesca Lonetti

Istituto di Scienza e Tecnologie dell'Informazione "A. Faedo" CNR







http://www.choreos.eu

Context of our work

- Part of the framework 7 EU funded CHOReOS project to implement a framework for scalable choreography development.
- Goal: "...enable domain experts to develop decentralized ultra-large scale (ULS) solutions composed of heterogeneous services that are adaptable and QoS (Quality-of-Service) aware"
- How to provide **user-centric** processes to support the whole life cycle of Service Oriented Computing systems from their:
 - Design, to their development, up to their maintenance and governance at run-time
- Based on business scenarios we will use a *dynamic taxi* management example



Choreography

- Service composition Orchestration
 - Services are arranged locally (centralized) to achieve a goal according to predetermined business logic and execution order
 - Often expressed in workflow notation such as BPEL
- Service composition Choreography
 - Services interact in a global scenario to achieve a goal without a single point of control (decentralized)
 - Protocol for direct peer-to-peer interaction (no orchestrator)
- Increased flexibility can deliver more adaptive service-based systems that satisfy more ambition requirements of different quality types.



Requirements Challenges

- 1. Optimize the specification of choreography diagrams with respect to system requirements;
 - Design flexible choreographies that can be argued to satisfy system requirements
- 2. Associate specified system requirements with choreography activities in a choreography diagram;
 - To specify the required behaviour and qualities of choreography activities in a model.
- 3. Enhance choreography diagrams with quality properties that trace system requirements, to support analysis and monitoring facilities.
 - Means to trace service qualities back to the originating quality requirements on the systems.
 - Taking requirements that are not monitorable and transforming them into properties that are to show continued requirements satisfaction.



Requirements-led approach

- Future Internet vision domain expert-centric process
- CHOReOS design components to specify QoS-aware service choreographies





Expressing Natural Language Requirements

- Our experiences have shown that domain experts can write functional requirements in natural language
- However we do not believe that they can express measurable quality requirements such as performance and reliability as effectively.
- Therefore, need for tool support for expressing quality requirements with simple and clear UI



Expressing Natural Language Requirements

	CHOREOS File Admin	
	Requirements	Requirement × View/Edit Requirement ×
	Satisfaction Arguments Domain Properties Requirements Clusters	Requirement ID: NFR0081 Date : 2013-10-01 17:14:42.0 Owner: WP8
		Requirement Name: Request to boarding taxi time
		Description: The user shall receive a prompt notification of how long it will take for their taxi to arrive
Free-text -		
		How happy you will be if this requirement is met? Unconcerned 1 🔵 2 🔵 3 💿 4 🔵 5 🔵 Extremely Happy
		How unhappy you will be if this requirement is not met? Unconcerned 1 🔵 2 🔵 3 🔵 4 💿 5 🔘 Extremely Unhappy
		Add Quality Add Satisfaction Argument
		Which of these is most important?
Quality		• Speed
Prompts –	>	Reliability
Docidad by		Security
Declued by		Accuracy
project		Level of importance:
consortium		
		Are any of the other qualities important?
		✓ Accuracy Medium (3)
		Security Select level
		Reliability Low (2)
		Medium (3)



Clustering Requirements

- Users express requirements on systems rather than service choreographies.
- Potential for requirements expressing similar functions or qualities overlaps and duplications need to be discovered and handled. (NB surrogate for service consumers)
- We wanted to provide them with support to cluster similar requirements that will map onto a single choreography diagram and its elements such as activities and roles.



Clustering Requirements



Keyword search

Sort



User task models for choreography specification





User task models for choreography specification

- Aim to bridge gap between the requirements and the choreography specification.
- Expand the user problem described by the requirements with classes of user tasks
- Help to provide an idea of the choreography tasks based on the set of requirements



Match requirements to user task models

- The cluster of requirements is matched to a catalogue of user task models using a service called TEDDiE
- The retrieved user task models are returned with the matched requirements





Request Taxi CTT model



Choice – gateway

User task models expressed in the ConcurTaskTrees (CTT) formalism Paterno F., Santoro C., Preventing User Errors by Systematic Analysis of Deviations from the System Task Model. International Journal of Human-Computer Studies, Vol. 56(2), 225-245 (2002)

XML output

<?xml version="1.0" encoding="UTF-8"?>

<Choreography name="CoTaxiing">

- <ChoreographyTasks>

<<u>ChoreographyTask name=</u>"Request route" id="1">CTT tasks: Retrieve input data, Input request details, Submit query, Detect current location, Retrieve Date and time, [Retrieve preferences], [Retrieve existing routes], Verify address, Provide preferences. Service Classes: LocationService, TimeDateService, RoutingService, AddressService, TrafficDetection, MapData</<u>ChoreographyTask></u><<u>ChoreographyTask name=</u>"Provide route" id="2">CTT tasks: Compute route, View route, Access map services, Retrieve traffic data.

Service Classes: LocationService, TimeDateService, RoutingService, AddressService, TrafficDetection, MapData</ChoreographyTask>
ChoreographyTask name="Request taxi booking" id="3">CIT tasks: Retrieve data, Provide taxi request details, Submit query, Detect current location, Retrieve Date and time, [Retrieve preferences], [Retrieve taxi membership details]. Service Classes: LocationService, TimeDateService, TaxiNotification, UserPreferences

<ChoreographyTask name="Deny request" id="4"/>

<ChoreographyTask name="Accept request" id="5"/>

<ChoreographyTask name="Provide taxi booking" id="6">CTT tasks: Process query, View booking, Retrieve taxi availability, Accept request, Deny request. Service Classes: LocationService, TimeDateService, TaxiNotification, UserPreferences</ChoreographyTask> <Gateway name="Accept/deny" id="7" type="Exclusive"/>

</ChoreographyTasks>

<Relationships>

```
<Relationship type="sequence" startID="1" endID="2"/>
<Relationship type="sequence" startID="2" endID="1"/>
<Relationship type="sequence" startID="3" endID="7"/>
<Relationship type="sequence" startID="4" endID="3"/>
<Relationship type="sequence" startID="4" endID="3"/>
<Relationship type="sequence" startID="4" endID="5"/>
<Relationship type="sequence" startID="5" endID="6"/>
<Relationship type="trace" startID="REQ2" endID="1"/>
<Relationship type="trace" startID="REQ3" endID="1"/>
<Relationship type="trace" startID="REQ3" endID="1"/>
```

Etc

```
<Relationship type="trace" startID="RE039" endID="3"/>
```

</Relationships>

- <Requirements>

- <Requirement name="Pre arrange taxi arrival time(FR0003)" id="REQ1">Traveller shall be able to arrange beforehand when the taxi shall arrive</Requirement>
- <Requirement name="Reservation time for Taxi Company(FR0004)" id="REQ2">Taxi company shall be able to receive a confirmation a couple hours before the reservation time from MID</Requirement>
- <Requirement name="VIP taxi subscriptions(FR0006)" id="REQ3">Traveller shall be able to subscribe to VIP taxi subscriptions to enhance prioritization</Requirement>
- <Requirement name="MID location coordinates(FR0008)" id="REQ4">MID shall be able to transmit location coordinates to taxi company</Requirement>
- <Requirement name="Taxi type(FR0009)" id="REQ5">Traveller shall be able to choose type of car, big boot, air-conditioning, etc.</Requirement>
- <Requirement name="Taxi Driver English language(FR0010)" id="REQ6">Traveller shall be able to request a taxi driver who speaks English </Requirement>
- <Requirement name="Taxi green card(FR0011)" id="REQ7">Traveller shall be able to request a taxi with green card</Requirement>

<Requirement name="MID send customer details(FR0012)" id="REQ8">MID shall be able to transmit traveller (customer) details to the taxi company</Requirement>

<Requirement name="Taxi number(FR0013)" id="REQ9">MID shall be able to display the taxi number that will pick up the traveller (customer)</Requirement>

<Requirement name="Taxi arrival time(FR0014)" id="REQ10">Traveller shall be able to know how long it will take for the taxi to arrive</Requirement>

Etc ...



Generate first-cut choreography diagram





First-cut choreography diagram

- Our approach uses the **Business Process Model and Notation** (www.bpmn.org), which is an emerging standard for business process modeling and the specification of service choreographies.
- The choreography designer designs BPMN choreographies using the MagicDraw visual modeling tool (www.nomagic.com), which we configured to accept the XML files output from the Requirements Tool.
- As a result, the choreography designer receives explicit requirements-based guidance for designing a service choreography based on a first-cut template model annotated with requirements information.



R P 8

∺ 🚟 🖧 🏹 🛃 - 💕

B- Z Relations

- 🔵 🖪

Code engineering sets

Full Featured

Containment

MagicDraw UML 17.0.4 - DynaRoute.mdzip [C:\Users\sbbb543\Desktop\CHOReOS\Im File Edit View Layout Diagrams Options Tools Analyze Collaborate W □ P² ■ • □ □ □ Δ Δ • <> • /* • 19 ■ ■ ■ ■ ■ ■ ■ ■

First-cut choreography diagram

Design advice

Containment tree





Mapping requirements to the choreography tasks

🗋 Add New 📗	Add Nested 🗋 Add Existing 📲 Delete From Table 🍵 Delete	ete 🤅 🏠 Up 🐺 Dow	vn 📲 Unnest Red	quirement ▶ [†] Nest Requirement nn Show Columns 📑 Show Full Path	ns	🗈 Exp	ort 📗 F	leport	1	_	_	Re	ear	uir	en	ne	nt	s t	ak	ole								
							6	\sim																				
# Id	Name	Transflat shall be able to a		Text																								
REQ1 Lis Pre arrange taxi arrival time(PR0003) Inaveller shall be able to a PEO2 PEO2			le to receive a con	formation a couple hours before the reservation time from MID																\cap	i a l'	i+\/	C (or	' O C			
2 RLQ2 3 PEO3	IN VID taxi subscriptions/ED0006)	Traveller shall be able to s	2 able to receive a confirmation a couple hours before the reservation time from MID																	Qu	aı	ιιγ	30	JUI	C 3			
4 RE04	MID location coordinates(ER0008)	MID shall be able to trans	mit location coordi	nates to taxi company																								_
5 PEOS	El Taxi type(EP0009)	Traveller shall be able to r			1			1	1	1	1	1	1		1				1	1	1	1	/:	5	1	-		
5 REQ5	Ell Taxi Cype(i Robos)	Traveller shall be able to r]												1									ĕ.	1.17	ni i	1 1	
7 RE07	El Taxi green card(ER0011)	Traveller shall be able to r																				· /		-	~ /	ö		
8 RE08	MID send customer details(FR0012)	MID shall be able to trans							÷															6	ا ف	2		
9 REO9	Taxi number (FR0013)	MID shall be able to displa							2															8	<u> </u>	Ť.	1 1	
10 REO10	Taxi arrival time(FR0014)	Traveller shall be able to							8													./		ö	80	Z	<u>-</u>	
11 REO11	Taxi arrival time alert(FR0015)	Traveller shall receive an							ō				÷					_				V		£.	8	2 8	0 1	
12 REQ12	Taxi pick up location on MID(FR0016)	MID shall allow the travel							£ .				5			. 5	F	1	- 1		<u> </u>			≝	2	8 2	5	
13 REQ13	MID inform of near taxi arrival(FR0017)	MID shall be able to inform						÷.	5				8.	<u>-</u>	1		n, i	2	5 1		4	4		-	if .	3 ¢	<u> -</u> 1	
14 REQ14	Send reserve taxi(FR0018)	Taxi company shall be abl	1			÷.		8	5				ō	ທີ			5	-	2 🕂		2	ശ	÷	낭	Z	8 9	2	
15 REQ15	Graphical coordinates on Navigator(FR0019)	Navigator shall be able to				N.		ö	<u>ظ</u>				£ .	٩.	1	: 2	2	ō	5 5		\sim		4	<u>e</u>	~	≃ ş	3 1	
16 REQ16	Customer recognition(FR0020)	Taxi driver shall be able to	1			8		2	10		÷		5		- 5	- 6	5 8	ŝ	2	5 E	. 20	S.	21	e	Ū.	말 같	2 I	
17 REQ17	Send customer location to taxi(FR0022)	MID shall be able to send	1			ö	<u> </u>	Ľ.	8		S.		60	2	1 2	9 9	8 H	- 2	2 2	2 🗐	Ö	8	<u></u>	e	<u> </u>	5 4	<u> </u>	
18 REQ18	Show nearby taxi stands(FR0028)	MID shall be able to show				₩	00	~	-		8	÷.	iπ .	6	- 2	5 8	- 3	; ŭ	: 68	ഗ്	8	2	8			ō <	5 1	
19 REQ19	Transmit destination info to taxis(FR0029)	MID shall be able to trans			Ŀ	5	8	<u>e</u> .	Ð		ē	6	te -	2 🛾	5 6	⊇ <u>≥</u>	2 2	1 골	ġ		μË	ff -	<u>ğ</u>	õ	2	8 1	_	
20 REQ20	Inform taxi company of customer location(FR0030)	MID shall be able to conta			E.	· -	ö	÷.	E		ff -	ö	ъ	li 🛛	E Č	5 1	= 2	2 0	5 8	(<u>m</u>	12	z	8	E .	<u>e</u> -	- 4	2	
21 REQ21	Quickest route(FR0038)	MID shall be able to find o			В	10	£.	-	꾩		-	2	5	Z.	5 8	3 8	≓'`````	5 È	i ii	: 8	m	\sim	Ш.	e	-E	61	đ	
22 REQ22	Traveller accept new route(FR0039)	Traveller shall be able to a			Ē	6	5	8	<u> </u>		B	Ш	ĭ,≝	~	ΥÌè	2 3	2 2	2 2	3 3	jŏ	÷.	5	2	-E		9	E _	_
23 REQ23	Taxi position accuarcy(NFR0057)	Traveller shall be able to r			۴	2	- 50	0	0	2	2	Ζ.	g	õ 🚽	5 9	5 5	8 8	2 3	2 2	e e e	÷	8	5	-	š	8 a	E R	2
24 REQ24	MID to Navigator destination details(FR0067)	MID shall be able to trans			Þ	5	Ĕ	۳	۳۵ –	ю.	2	\sim	÷	<u> </u>	- 3	5 2	5 🏛	- 3	<u>,</u>	≦∣≌	-	2	È	š	5	ō !	e e	٤.
25 REQ25	Current taxi waiting times(NFR0076)	The user shall be provider			E	.≝		77	>	8	2	(C)	8	2	פן פ	⊡ ÷	⊨ I €	8 7	5 10		2	8	S.	5	ā.	8 8	5 8	5
26 REQ26	Efficient Taxi booking(NFR0077)	The user shall be able to u			E		50	ō	E	2	ē	÷	-ŏ	2°	⊎ 4	5 J	2.0	<u>ء</u> ه		: P	5	<u> </u>	Ē	ā	8	0	σœ	4
27 REQ27	Reliable Taxi booking(NFR0078)	The user shall be able to i	1		E	8	×	12	ä	Ш.	5	8	=	÷	ō -	ð s	2 2	3 7	5 -5	÷ 🗄	- .	5	ē	8	<u>-</u>	84	등 문	2
28 REQ28	User preferences for booking(NFR0079)	The user shall be able to (1		R	-	2	č	E	~	£.	ğ	8	<u>e</u>	8 .	ē t	5 6	- a	5 - <u>-</u>		. <u>ss</u>	Ð	- <u>-</u>	-	5	φ	δœ	5
29 REQ29	Route preferences(NFR0080)	The user shall be able to e	1		Þ	ല	5	12	8	- <u></u>	e	2	8	5			E 8	2 8	8 ÷#	t S		g	×.	2	e -	≥ 9	ē +	4
30 REQ30	Request to boarding taxi time(NFR0081)	The user shall receive a p	1		P	5	÷.	ŭ	- E	5	ŭ	5	÷.	×	â l	¥ ¥	Ë .9		; č		Ĕ	- 2	تد	a d	Ð.	10 1	- <u>e</u>	٤.
31 REQ31	Booking receipt duration(NFR0082)	The user shall receive a ta			-	픘	τ.	Ρ	æ	<u> </u>	10	÷2	δ	2 🗖	- 6	≚ 4	2 7	5 2	s <u>e</u>	2 @		8	<u>_</u>	8	e	é i	มิส	÷.
32 REQ32	Secure taxi booking(NFR0083)	The transmission of upor a	1		Ľ	3	<u>e</u>	듣.	- 22	5	Ð	S	2		20	υ 9	2 2	5 5	6 0	<u>-</u>	-	0	- <u>e</u>	5	0	들 글	2 ¥	ź.
33 REQ33	Secure transmission of data(NFR0084) El Secure starsage of reguests(NED0085)	The storage of user regul]		Б	<u> </u>	5	5	E	ŝ	-	ă	2	5	<u>ت</u> ق	5 9	_	2 9	2.5	: <u>2</u>	<u>e</u>	<u>e</u>	÷,	Ō.	<u>_</u>	8 i	5 - 4	4
35 PEO35	Secure storage of preferences/NEP0086)	The storage of user user]		5	2	8	E	5	Ξ.	2	· 🖂	0	E 🗖	<u> </u>	₽ 8	5 1	5 e	÷ č	5	8	8	đ	· 🛛	÷ č	x 3	z <u>5</u>	į.,
35 REQ35	The second	A taxi company shall resp	1		R	a di	Ĕ.	2	<u>ب</u>	2	2	iπ,	ŧ.	3		D d	ñ C	ō ā) ă	i ŭ	- e	ŭ	Ð	iθ.	ŏ	i (d T	į.
37 REQ30	Ell Booking request response time to user/NEP.0088)	The user shall receive pro			Ρ.	ഗ	ഗ	-	-	0	-	-	2			¥ -				ւտ	ഗ	ഗ	<u>c</u>	-	• •		- 0	1
38 REO38	Taxi company accept or deny booking request (NER0089	A taxi company shall be a			-		<u> </u>	6 6	<u> 20</u>	8 6	6 6		6 6	e 🗌	2 P	a		1 1	-		<u> </u>	<u>~</u>		<u> </u>	<u>۲</u>	ee e	a 🖻	4
39 REO39	Taxi driver booking confirmation(NER0091)	The taxi driver shall recei																										4
40 REO40	Calculate route(FR0097)	Navigator shall be able to		EMO	1	1		1	1	1	1	1	1	1	-	5 1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	2	1	2 1	1	
				2110		-		-	-	-	-	-	-	-					-	-	-	-	-	-	-			
			i 🖆 🖅	C2 - Co-Taxi-ing	11	1			1			1			1 1	1												
			Τ.	,	- P.,	_			-			-		_														
				🗂 Board taxi	r																							
						-			-			-		_														
				Confirm taxi request										r.														
D	oquiromonte						_	_	_	_	_				-					_	·		_	_				
	equilements -		<u> </u>	a CoTaxiing				1		1	1		1	1	4 4	1 1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	2	1	2 1	1 1	
	•	\rightarrow		·	- 12					-	Ξ.		-	-					_	_	_	_	_	-		-		÷
+-	ack matrix	-		Construction Set route													1											٢.
L.	dSK IIIdliix							-	_	-	-		-			4	~ ⁻	_	_		1			_				-
				Request Taxi Service									1		1	<pre>/</pre>					K	Ľ	2					
				Deny request											1	/								1		/		1
															Ľ									E.				
				Carl Accept Request										P										2	6	∕ ⊻	/	
																/		1	11	11					/	_		
															_										-			



Refine choreography diagram





Refine choreography diagram





Specify non-functional properties





Q4BPMN (Quality for BPMN)

- Implemented in MagicDraw as a design tool for specifying nonfunctional properties within a BPMN choreography diagram
- The quality annotations can be applied to:
 - a single task («Q4Task»);
 - specific participant of a task («Q4Participants»); or
 - whole choreography («Q4Choreography»)
- It currently defines four classes of properties:
 - dependability properties
 - performance properties
 - security properties
 - accuracy properties
- Properties services entering the choreography will have to abide by.
- Potential participants can understand quality level required on their part.



Q4BPMN (Quality for BPMN)

- We identified **three main concerns** representing the different contexts of the quality requirements:
- **Software System:** quality attributes quantifying either the behavior of software components, or their interactions;
- *Human–Computer Interaction*: quality attributes quantifying any interactions between a human and any part of the considered software system;
- **Business Activities:** quality attributes quantifying the admissible constraint used in order to characterize the activities of both the whole system (i.e. software + human related activities), and its actors from a business perspective.



Mapping values

• Some examples from the taxi management scenario

	Property	Dimension	Property Name	Levels				
	Туре	Dimension	Flopenty Name	1	2	3	4	5
Software	Accuracy	Time	timeAC_Software	3 sec	2 sec	1 sec	30 msec	5 msec
System	Security	Encryption	encryptionSEC_Software			optional SSL	SSL	SSL
	Dependability	Downtime	downtimeDEP_Software	30 sec/1 d	30 sec/2 d	30 sec/1 w	30 sec/1 m	30 sec/6 m
	Performance	Time	timePER_Software	10 sec	5 sec	2 sec	500 msec	50 msec
	Trust							
Human-	Accuracy	Time	timeAC_HCI	10 sec	8 sec	7 sec	5 sec	2 sec
Computer Interactions	Security	Encryption	encryptionSEC_HCI			optional SSL	SSL	SSL
	Dependability	Downtime	downtimeDEP_HCI	30 sec/1 d	30 sec/2 d	30 sec/1 w	30 sec/1 m	30 sec/6 m
	Performance	Time	timePER_HCI	15 sec	5 sec	2.5 sec	1 sec	500 msec
	Trust							
	Accuracy	Time	timeAC_Business	2 h	1 h	30 min	15 min	5 min
Business Activities		Space	spaceAC_Business	optional 7.8 m	7.8 m	5 m	3 m	3 m
	Security							
	Dependability	Downtime	downtimeDEP_Business	5 min/1 d	5 min/2 d	5 min/1 w	5 min/1 m	5 min/6 m
	Performance	Time	timePER_Business	optional 1 h	optional 30 min	15 min	5 min	90 sec
	Trust	Number of Re- sources	resourcesTRU_Business	10 Units	30 Units	50 Units	70 Units	100 Units



Q4BPMN (Quality for BPMN) Example

Choreography	Original requirement	Quality Property						
element, Name	Name, ID, description, quality							
Task Request Taxi Service	MID send customer details (NFR0012): <i>MID</i> shall be able to transmit traveller (customer) details to the taxi company [Performance 5]	<pre>timePer_Software_L5 isHard = true metrics - DefaultMaxDurationMetric nature = PRESCRIPTIVE operator = LESS EQUAL propertyClass - PERFORMANCE unit = "msec" value = "50"</pre>						
Participant property Taxi Company	Reputable taxi company (NFR0086): <i>The taxi</i> company shall have an established reputation [Security 4]	 taxiCompanyBusinessTrust NF Properties = resourcesTRU_Business_L4 ParticipantRef = Taxi Company 						



Software monitors from Q4BPMN

- Q4BPMN enables us to map quality requirements into monitorable properties on a choreography model, a task, participants in a task
- Generated monitoring module determines whether a property associated to a quality requirement is satisfied using observed data and messages.
- The approach uses event-based monitor includes a complex eventprocessing engine based on Drools Fusion.
- E.g. Latency property
 - e₁ event starts incomingRequest, and finishes with outgoingResponse event
 - Rules monitor the completion of events and calculate average completion times.



Lessons Learned (1)

- Expressing requirements
 - 97 requirements successfully specified and used to generate meaningful first-cut choreography diagrams.
 - Secondary qualities not used in practice.
- Clustering requirements
 - Natural language processing on similarity algorithm took too long (over 5 minutes per invocation on the requirements set)
 - Matrix a solution?
- Retrieving task models for draft BPMN model
 - Varying success on CTT models to draft BPMN. Need to expand catalogue and evaluate the effectiveness in further studies.



Lessons Learned (2)

- Mapping requirements to choreography tasks
 - In our example, 38 out of the 40 clustered requirements were automatically mapped to choreography tasks and provided a useful starting point for the user.
 - Mapping issues however. Mapped to CTT model, not individual choreography tasks
 - Requirements granularity issues high level requirements over several tasks vs low level requirements.
 - NFR0077: The user shall be able to use the taxi booking system efficiently mapped across 5 choreography tasks
 - Need decomposition and requirements trace. Via Satisfaction Arguments?



Lessons Learned (3)

- Reconciling the user expressed quality scores with actual values for the quality properties – a big challenge.
 - Tried to use values from literature but wasn't too successful.
 - A lot of input from domain experts needed. Ultimately those with knowledge of the taxi domain set the values.
- Integration of tools
 - Successful in a forwards process, with trace to the original requirements but...
 - no backwards compatibility between MD and the requirements tool – reduces the usefulness of the tool support.
- No need for dedicated IT professionals to provide the skills needed for architectural design and software engineering? yes and no



Conclusion

- End-to-end approach for generating service-based systems that can be traced to their originating requirements
- Integrated toolkit based on BPMN modelling in MagicDraw
- Task models provide domain knowledge and functional constraints
 for choreography design
- QoS quality requirements that are not measurable are mapped to measurable, and thus monitorable, non-functional properties (Q4BPMN profile)
- Future work?
 - Address lesson learned
 - Further application to new case studies